

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10084487 7

Debtor and Creditor: Cases, Notes and Materials

Professors

M.J. Trebilcock .

B.J. Reiter

J.B. Laskin

1978
Volume 2

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
August 1978

Store
KF
1536
ZA2
T7
1978
v.2

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 19 1978

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

DEBTOR AND CREDITOR:
CASES, NOTES AND MATERIALS

Volume 2

122
M.J. Trebilcock
B.J. Reiter
J.B. Laskin

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
1978

781
1536
2A2
T7
1978
v.2



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/debtorcreditorca02treb>

SUMMARY OF CHAPTERS

Volume 1

1. The Nature of a Debt
2. The Economics of Debt Collection
3. Debt and the Invasion of Privacy
4. Self-Help Collection
5. Actions Prior to Judgment
6. The Effect of Judgment and Interest upon Judgment
7. Examination of the Judgment Debtor
8. Exemptions from the Execution Process

Volume 2

9. Execution
10. Garnishment
11. Residual Methods of Execution
12. Rights of the Debtor After Judgment
13. Priorities Among Creditors
14. Special Creditors

Volume 3

15. The Operation of the Execution System and Proposals for Reform
16. Mechanics' Liens
17. Impeachable Transactions

Volume 4

18. Introduction to Bankruptcy
19. Alternatives to Bankruptcy
20. Beginning the Process
21. The Property of the Bankrupt
22. Distributing the Estate and Discharge

APPENDIX: Problems

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 9: EXECUTION

A. Introduction	274
(a) Introductory Note	274
(b) <u>The Execution Act</u>	274
(c) <u>The Creditors' Relief Act</u>	283
(d) <u>Federal Court Act</u>	284
(e) Supreme Court of Ontario, <u>Rules of Practice</u>	285
(f) <u>The Small Claims Court Act</u>	290
 B. Fieri Facias	 294
(a) The Binding Effect	294
(i) La Forest, "Some Aspects of the Writ of Fieri Facias"	294
(ii) <u>The Land Titles Act</u>	295
(iii) Notice	296
(b) Issue and Renewal	297
(i) Supreme Court of Ontario, <u>Rules of Practice</u>	298
(ii) <u>The Limitations Act</u>	298
(iii) Note	298
(c) Exigible Property	301
(i) Generally	301
1. Dunlop, "Execution Against Personal Property in England and British Columbia"	301
2. Note: Property Subject to Execution	305
(ii) Real Estate Transactions	306
<u>Kimniak v. Anderson</u>	306
<u>Robinson v. Moffatt</u>	310
<u>McDonald v. Royal Bank</u>	313
<u>Davidson v. Davidson</u>	315

(iii)	Contingent Interests	320
(iv)	Mortgages of Land	321
(v)	Chattel Mortgages and Conditional Sales	321
	Interest of Vendor and Mortgagees of Chattels	321
	Interest of Purchasers and Mortgagors of Chattels	322
	<u>Ruscheinsky v. A. Spencer Co. Ltd.</u>	323
(vi)	Money, Bills of Exchange and Specialties or other Security for money (s. 19(1))	324
(vii)	Book Debts and Choses in Action	325
	<u>Re A.G. Ont. and Royal Bank of Canada</u>	326
(viii)	Joint Tenancies	331
	<u>Re Young</u>	332
	<u>Sirois v. Breton</u>	335
(ix)	Family Assets	339
	<u>The Family Law Reform Act 1978</u>	340
(x)	Partnership Interests	345
	<u>Sandham v. Sandham Bros.</u>	345
(xi)	Company Shares	348
	<u>Associates Finance Co. Ltd. v. Webber et al.</u>	349
(d)	Purchasers of Goods from the Sheriff	357
(i)	Introductory Note	357
(ii)	<u>The Personal Property Security Act</u>	358
(iii)	The Problem of Renewals	362
(iv)	Interpleader	363
(e)	Functions and Responsibilities of the Sheriff	368
(i)	Relationship with the Execution Creditor	368
	<u>Morris v. Salbert</u>	369
	<u>Graves v. Sprague</u>	371
(ii)	The Mechanics of Seizure	372
	<u>Watson v. Murray</u>	373
	<u>Re Bishop and Traders Finance Corporation Ltd. et al.</u>	377

	<u>Regina v. Vroom</u>	380
(iii)	The Use of Force	385
	<u>Hudson v. Fletcher</u>	389
	<u>Vaughan v. McKenzie</u>	392
(iv)	The Duty to Obtain a Fair Price	395
	<u>Smith v. Colles</u>	396
	<u>Pease v. Tudge</u>	397
	Trebilcock & Shulman -- "The Pathology of Credit Breakdown"	401

CHAPTER 10: GARNISHMENT

A.	Introduction	404
	(a) Note	404
	(b) Supreme Court of Ontario, <u>Rules of Practice</u>	405
	(c) <u>The Small Claims Courts Act</u>	406
	(d) <u>The Apportionment Act</u>	410
	(e) <u>The Creditors' Relief Act</u>	411
B.	Effect of Service of the Garnishment Order: Priorities Problems Between Garnishor and Prior Assignees of the Debt	412
	(a) Introductory Note	412
	(i) <u>Kare v. North West Packers Ltd. et al.</u>	415
	(ii) <u>Industrial Development Bank v. Valley Dairy Ltd.</u>	421
	(iii) <u>General Brake & Clutch Service Ltd. v. W.A. Scott & Sons Ltd.</u>	422
	(b) Rights of Garnishors, Garnishees and Assignees	427
	<u>Yates v. Terry</u>	427
C.	Debts Subject to Garnishment	429
	(a) Introductory Note	429
	(b) Debts Owing or Accruing Due	431
	(i) <u>Quercetti v. Tranquilli</u>	431

(ii)	<u>Garner v. Strickland and Western Forest Industries Ltd.</u>	433
(iii)	<u>Lee v. MacDonald</u>	435
(iv)	<u>Sandy v. Yukon Construction Co. Ltd. and Rush and Tompkins Construction Ltd.</u>	438
(v)	<u>Webb v. Stenton</u>	443
(vi)	<u>Canadian Bank of Commerce v. Dabrowski and Dabrowski and Hunt</u>	446
(vii)	<u>D.M. Gordon, Case and Comment</u>	447
(viii)	<u>Moir v. Franciotta</u>	449
(c)	Conditional/Contingent Debts	451
(i)	Insurance Proceeds	451
	<u>Vater v. Styles</u>	451
(ii)	Trust Funds	455
(iii)	Note: Conditional Debts	455
(d)	Bank Accounts	458
(i)	Deposit Accounts	458
	<u>Bel-Fran Investments Ltd. v. Pantuity Holdings Limited and Bank of Montreal (Garnishee)</u>	458
(ii)	Joint Accounts	463
	<u>Re Davis, Nash and Davis v. Royal Bank of Canada</u>	464
	<u>Re Adler</u>	468
(e)	Debts to a Partnership	471
	<u>Hoon v. Maloff et al.</u>	471
D.	Protection of Wages	473
(a)	<u>Wages Act</u>	473
(b)	Note: The English Position	474
(c)	Note: Protection of the Debtor-Employee from Dismissal	475
E.	Proposals for Reform	477
(a)	Pre-trial Garnishment and the Requirement of a Bond	477
(b)	Execution Against Property First	477
(c)	The Continuing Garnishee Order	478
(d)	The Instalment Payment Order	478

(e) The Ohio Trusteeship Plan Prior to Garnishment	480
(f) Dismissal from Employment	482
(g) Abolition of Wage Garnishment	483

CHAPTER 11. RESIDUAL METHODS OF EXECUTION

A. Introduction	487
(a) Dunlop "Execution Against Personal Property in England and British Columbia	487
B. Equitable Execution By Way of Appointment of a Receiver	498
(a) <u>The Judicature Act</u>	498
(b) <u>The Creditors' Relief Act</u>	498
(c) Some Judicial Precedents	499
(i) <u>Re Karch</u>	499
(ii) <u>Garry Finance Corporation Ltd. v. Heizman</u>	501
(iii) <u>McCarr v. McCarr and Adams</u>	502
(iv) <u>Collins v. Hall</u>	504
(v) <u>Dowell v. Aikenhead</u>	506
(d) Partnership Assets	507
(i) Ontario Supreme Court, <u>Rules of Practice</u>	507
(ii) <u>The Partnerships Act</u>	507
C. Charging Orders	508
(a) <u>The Judicature Act</u>	508
(b) Supreme Court of Ontario, <u>Rules of Practice</u>	509
(c) Ellis, "The Charging Order - A Neglected Means of Enforcement"	510
D. Attachment, Committal and Sequestration	513
(a) Supreme Court of Ontario, <u>Rules of Practice</u>	513

(b)	<u>The Small Claims Courts Act</u>	515
(c)	<u>Leaseconcept Ltd. v. French</u>	516

CHAPTER 12: RIGHTS OF THE DEBTOR AFTER JUDGMENT

Introduction	519
A. Delaying Execution	520
(a) Stay of Execution Pending Appeal	520
(i) <u>Supreme Court of Ontario, Rules of Practice</u>	520
(ii) <u>The Supreme Court Act</u>	520
(iii) <u>The County Courts Act</u>	522
(iv) <u>The Small Claims Court Act</u>	523
<u>Schipper v. Linkon</u>	524
(v) <u>The Highway Traffic Act</u>	526
B. Consolidation Orders	527
(a) <u>Small Claims Court Act</u>	527
(b) <u>Re Landry</u>	530

CHAPTER 13: PRIORITIES AMONG CREDITORS

A. Introductory Note	535
B. The Legislation	535
(a) <u>The Execution Act</u>	535
(b) <u>The Creditors' Relief Act</u>	535

C. Some Cases	547
(a) <u>Union Bank of Canada v. Taylor</u>	549
(b) <u>Benjamin Moore & Co. Ltd. v. Finnie</u>	549
(c) <u>Re Sudbury Daily Star Ltd. v. Moxon's Furniture Ltd. et al.</u>	551

D. Proposals for Reform	554
-------------------------	-----

CHAPTER 14: SPECIAL CREDITORS

Introduction	556
--------------	-----

A. The Right of the Crown to Priority of Payment	557
(a) Crown Perogative	557
(b) Stautory Liens, Priorities and Special Forms of Execution	558
(c) Attempts to Limit the Crown's Priority	561
(d) Priority As Between The Dominion and Provincial Governments	562
(e) Some Cases	563
(i) <u>Regina v. Hamilton</u>	563
(ii) <u>Bank of Montreal v. Union Gas Co. of Canada Ltd.</u>	567
(iii) <u>Sandberg v. Meurer and M.N.R.</u>	571
(iv) <u>The Queen v. Workmen's Compensation Board and City of Edmonton</u>	572
(v) <u>Tudor Holdings Ltd. v. Robertson et al.</u>	576
(vi) <u>In Re Silver Bros. Ltd.</u>	578
(f) Note: Tassé Committee	583

B. Enforcing Family Support Obligations	585
(a) Introduction	585
(b) Family Support Generally	585
(c) <u>The Family Law Reform Act</u>	580

(d)	Maintenance Upon Divorce	593
(e)	The Problem of Arrears	595
C.	The Taxation of a Solicitor's Bill	596
D.	Utility Shut-offs	597
E.	Compensation For Loss of Property as a Result of a Criminal Act	598
F.	The Wage Earner as Creditor	599
(a)	Extended Liability for Wages Beyond the Immediate Employer	599
(i)	<u>Business Corporations Act</u>	599
(ii)	<u>Canada Business Corporations Act</u>	600
(iii)	<u>Employment Standards Act</u>	601
(b)	Summary Means of Enforcing a Wage Debt	602
(i)	<u>Employment Standards Act</u>	602
(ii)	<u>The Master and Servant Act</u>	604
	<u>Winkler v. High Test Electrical Manufacturing Ltd.</u>	606
(iii)	<u>The Apprenticeship and Tradesmen Act</u>	609
(iv)	<u>Industrial Standards Act</u>	609
(v)	<u>The Ministry of Transportation and Communications Creditors Payment Act</u>	610
(vi)	<u>Government Contracts Hours and Wages Act</u>	610
(vii)	Possessory Liens for Some Workers	611
(c)	Priority of Wage Claimants	611
(i)	<u>Wages Act</u>	611
(ii)	<u>Employment Standards Act</u>	612
(iii)	<u>Bankruptcy Act</u>	613
(iv)	<u>The Mechanics' Lien Act</u>	613
(d)	Priorities Problems	614
(i)	<u>Re Campeau Corp. and Provincial Bank of Canada et al.</u>	614
(ii)	<u>Roach v. McLachlan</u>	617

